To: Interested Parties
Fr: CFFE PAC
Re: Breaking News Message Test: Republican & Military Leader Statements
October 26, 2024

Methodology: This memo is based on results from two randomized controlled survey experiments conducted by Blue Rose Research on October 22-23 and 24-25 with 9,262 likely voters nationwide. CAFFE PAC tested a total of 29 written Democratic messages, most from verbatim public statements during the week of October 21; some used additional framing language from the Winning Jobs Narrative that tested well in recent research. Results show the percentile scores out of over 550 messages tested since July 2024. Full methodology and message language is in the appendix on page 7. Additional CFFE PAC research can be found here.

Key Findings:

1. Clear and concise economic plans or appeals to working across party lines provide powerful openings for non-economic topics.

2. The constantly growing number of Republican and military leaders who support Harris is more effective than discussing the ones that oppose Trump. Sometimes fewer details are more effective in these short messages.

3. Statements about specific military generals fall relatively flat, as do statements about fascism, dictators, Hitler's generals, shooting protestors, invading North Korea, and killing Trump's Vice President at the Capitol riot.

Summary Results:

1. **Only 13 of 30 messages outperformed the standard Republican message** about inflation)-0.9% on Harris vs. Trump vote choice). **Many of the messages tested are among the lowest performing** in the database of over 550 messages. See Suboptimal Message section on page 4.

2. The **best message in this test** used the words from the Vice President's narration in a :30 video titled "Your Family". It moved the vote choice 1.2% which ranks at the 86% percentile among all messages (but it only ranked in the 78th percentile with 2020 Trump voters):

"This election is a choice between two different visions for America. Harris will take on price gouging to bring down grocery prices and lower the cost of health insurance. Trump wants to cut taxes for the wealthy. Harris wants to cut taxes for the middle class. You may not always agree with her but she will lift up the middle class and be a President for all Americans."

3. **Only 4 messages outperformed the standard GOP inflation message among people who voted for Trump in 2020.** They are listed below ranked by Trump 2020 vote.

"She is fighting for an America that puts our freedoms and opportunities first. Hardworking people, small business owners, and family farmers built America into the greatest country in the world. America is stronger when we work together to overcome division and distrust. Kamala Harris will <u>work across party lines to lower costs, raise incomes, and protect our freedoms</u>." (+1.2, 82nd Percentile Overall and 96th percentile with 2020 Trump voters)

"She is working to grow our economy by raising Americans' incomes and lowering costs. She will work with leaders in both parties to solve problems for the American people. <u>Many former national security officials and military leaders are supporting Harris for President.</u>" (+1.1, 80th Percentile Overall and 95th percentile with 2020 Trump voters)

"She is working to grow our economy by raising Americans' incomes and lowering costs. She will work with leaders in both parties to solve problems for the American people. <u>Economists say that Trump's proposed policies will result in higher prices, higher deficits, and higher interest rates. Many Republican elected officials and former military officers are supporting Harris, even though they disagree with some of her policies</u>." (+1.2, 85th Percentile Overall and 88th percentile with 2020 Trump voters)

"She will work across party lines to lower costs, raise incomes, and protect our freedoms. <u>Every day, more Republican elected officials are courageously supporting Harris for President. Leaders in our country understand what is at stake, regardless of their political party</u>." (+1.1, 73rd Percentile Overall and 87th percentile with 2020 Trump voters)

4. **Three UNITY sentences performed well.**

"Kamala Harris will work across party lines to lower costs, raise incomes, and protect our freedoms."

"Kamala Harris will work with leaders in both parties to solve problems for the American people."

"You may not always agree with her but Kamala Harris will lift up the middle class and be a President for all Americans."

5. Statements about **Republicans and military leaders <u>SUPPORTING</u> Harris for President are more compelling than examples of Republicans or military leaders <u>OPPOSING</u> Trump.** The four sentences below were the most powerful GOP support statements. The first message below highlights GOP support despite policy disagreements ranked in the 85th percentile, compared to 71st without those words. A message using Wyoming Congresswoman Liz Cheney (+1.1, 75th Percentile) slightly outperformed Former Vice President Dick Cheney (+0.9, *59-51st* Percentile[1]). Adding details about Senators Murkowski and Romney opposing Trump to the Liz Cheney message dropped it to the 65th

---

[1] Implied percentile range for this message from test #1 based on vote choice movement compared to more recent percentile rankings in test #2.

percentile. Similarly, adding Harris' pledge to appoint a Republican to serve at a senior level in her Cabinet dropped the message to the 51st percentile. The Winning Jobs Narrative Closing Arguments memo ([page 5](#)) found that adding this sentence *"Last week, former Defense Secretary General Mattis agreed with Four Star General Milley that former President Trump was quote 'the most dangerous person ever'* — lowered the effectiveness of the message and created a backlash effect with Republican respondents.

"Many Republican elected officials and former military officers are supporting Harris, <u>even though they disagree with some of her policies</u>."

"Many former national security officials and military leaders are supporting Harris for President."

"Every day, more Republican elected officials are courageously supporting Harris for President. Leaders in our country understand what is at stake, regardless of their political party."

"Republican elected officials are supporting Harris for President — like Wyoming Congresswoman Liz Cheney, Arizona Senator Jeff Flake, and many others."

6. **Trump contrast messages require positive framing and precise calibration to be effective.** Since July, CFFE PAC has tested over 50 messages exploring direct contrast statements about Donald Trump. Most fail to clear the 50th percentile and many are near the bottom of the rankings. The Winning Jobs Narrative project found similar results in hundreds of messages over the past few years. Effective contrasts typically open with positive goal statements, followed by clear and concise explanations of how his future plans or past results hurt working Americans. The four top contrast messages below are ranked by overall impact; two didn't use a pocketbook contrast but did include Harris' economic goals:

"... <u>Trump wants to cut taxes for the wealthy. Harris wants to cut taxes for the middle class</u>." (Full message above, +1.2, 86th Percentile Overall and 78th with 2020 Trump voters).

"... <u>Economists say that Trump's proposed policies will result in higher prices, higher deficits, and higher interest rates</u>. <u>Many Republican elected officials and former military officers are supporting Harris, even though they disagree with some of her policies</u>." (Full message above, +1.2, 85th Percentile Overall and 88th Percentile with 2020 Trump voters).

"The decision for the American people in this election is very serious. Either <u>Trump will sit in the Oval Office plotting revenge and retribution against his enemies</u>. Or Harris will work to lift up the American people by bringing down grocery prices or investing in our economy, our small businesses, and our families." (+1.1%, 75th Percentile Overall and 72nd Percentile with 2020 Trump voters).

"She will work across party lines to lower costs, raise incomes, and protect our freedoms. She will work with leaders in both parties to solve problems for the American people. <u>Trump is increasingly unstable and unhinged. He wants unchecked power. He wants the military to go after any American who disagrees with him</u>." (+1,1%, 70th Percentile Overall and 74th Percentile with 2020 Trump voters).

SUBOPTIMAL MESSAGES

Many messages did not work well. Typically, these messages did not have any pocketbook connection or were entirely negatively framed.

1. **Messages including John Kelly's statements about Trump, America, Fascism, and Dictatorship -** 9 messages ranked as some of the lowest in the testing system database.

Treatment	Content	Harris Trump Vote Choice	Percentile
Harris Unity + Policy but Not Risk	She will work with leaders in both parties to solve problems for the American people. Many Republican elected leaders and senior military officials are opposing Trump. Even though they agree with many of his policies, they don't think we can take the risk of him becoming President again.	0.7%	40%
Harris Unity + Kelly: w/out Son + Policies + w/out Danger:NYT -	She will work with leaders in both parties to solve problems for the American people. Trump's own White House Chief of Staff, a former 4-star General, said in an interview on October 22nd that he agreed with many of Trump's policies but, quote "it's a very dangerous thing to have the wrong person elected to high office."	0.5%	23%
Harris Unity + Kelly: w/out Son + Policies + w/out Danger	She will work with leaders in both parties to solve problems for the American people. Trump's own White House Chief of Staff, a former 4-star General, said in an interview on October 22nd that he agreed with many of Trump's policies but still does not want him to become President again.	0.4%	19%
Kelly: H4P Spox	Trump's own White House Chief of Staff, a former 4-star General, said in an interview on October 22nd that he agreed with many of Trump's policies but still does not want him to become President again. The people who know Trump best are ringing alarm bells about a second Trump term, where an unhinged and unrestrained Trump surrounded by loyalists and yes-men is a risk America cannot afford.	0.3%	14%
Kelly: w/Son + Policies + Danger	Trump's own White House Chief of Staff, a former 4-star General whose son died in combat in Afghanistan, said in an interview on October 22nd that he agreed with many of Trump's policies but still does not want him to become President again. The General believes Trump is far too dangerous to make president again.	0.3%	13%
Kelly: w/out Son + Policies + Definition of Fascist	Trump's own White House Chief of Staff, a former 4-star General, said in an interview on October 22nd that he agreed with many of Trump's policies but still does not want him to become President again. The General said quote "he's certainly an authoritarian, admires people who are dictators. So he certainly falls into the general definition of fascist, for sure."	0.3%	13%
Kelly: America and Constitution	Trump's own White House Chief of Staff, a former 4-star General, said in an interview on October 22nd that he agreed with many of Trump's policies but still does not want him to become President again. He said quote "He's certainly the only president that has all but rejected what America is all about, and what makes America America, in terms of our Constitution and our values."	0.3%	12%
Kelly: Military attack the Enemy Within	Trump's own White House Chief of Staff, a former 4-star General, said in an interview on October 22nd that he agreed with many of Trump's policies but still does not want him to become President again. He said quote "using the military to go after American citizens is a very bad thing, even to say it for political purposes to get elected. Let alone actually doing it."	0.2%	11%
Kelly: w/out Son + Policies + Dictator Approach	Trump's own White House Chief of Staff, a former 4-star General, said in an interview on October 22nd that he agreed with many of Trump's policies but still does not want him to become President again. The General said quote "He certainly prefers the dictator approach to government."	0.1%	8%

2. **Blueprint Polling Closing Argument -** Importantly, the top testing message from an [October 16 memo](#) published by Blueprint Polling tested in only the 16% percentile among over 550 messages in the Blue Rose Research database. A second version tested with additional framing and without the reference to killing the Vice President at the Capitol Riot still only ranks in the 36% percentile.

Solve Problems + Blueprint Closing without Capitol Riot	She will work with leaders in both parties to solve problems for the American people. Nearly half of Donald Trump's cabinet have refused to endorse him. Republican Governors, Senators, and House members have all said the same thing: we can't give Trump another four years as president.	0.7%	36%
Blueprint Closing Argument (Verbatim)	Nearly half of Donald Trump's cabinet have refused to endorse him. When Trump learned during the Capitol riot that his supporters were threatening to kill his own vice president, he said "so what?" and refused to do anything to ensure the vice president was safe. Republican governors, senators, and House members have all said the same thing: we can't give Trump another four years as president.	0.4%	16%

3. **Descriptions of Trump's previous suggestions to shoot American protestors, invade North Korea, or his desire to have Hilter's generals rank low even coupled with appeals to unity.** All of the messages in the next table began with *"She will work across party lines to lower costs, raise incomes, and protect our freedoms…"*

Unity + Protesters & Generals	… When Trump was President, he wanted to shoot Americans who were peacefully protesting against violence. But the American Generals and senior White House staff stopped him. Now, many people who know Trump best because they served in his White House, don't want him to be President again.	0.9%	59%
Unity + North Korea & Generals	… When Trump was President, he wanted to attack North Korea even though they have nuclear weapons. But the American Generals and senior White House staff stopped him. Now, many people who know Trump best because they served in his White House, don't want him to be President again.	0.8%	38%
MVP Oct 23 Remarks: Hitler's Generals	… This week, Donald Trump's former chief of staff, John Kelly, a retired four-star general, confirmed that while Trump was president he said he wanted generals like Adolf Hitler had. Trump does not want a military that is loyal to the United States Constitution. He wants a military that is only loyal to him.	0.7%	35%

SIMILAR MESSAGES

Many of the messages tested had similar written structures. Here are a few charts comparing some of those similarities that didn't appear previously in the memo. These six messages began with *"She is working to grow our economy by raising Americans' incomes and lowering costs. She will work with leaders in both parties to solve problems for the American people."*

Economist + GOP & Military Even Though They Disagree	[Grow + Both +] Economists say that Trump's proposed policies will result in higher prices, higher deficits, and higher interest rates. Many Republican elected officials and former military officers are supporting Harris, even though they disagree with some of her policies.	1.2%	85%
Economists + GOP & Military w/out Disagree	[Grow + Both +] Economists say that Trump's proposed policies will result in higher prices, higher deficits, and higher interest rates. Many Republican elected officials and former military officers are supporting Harris.	1.1%	71%

GOP Support w/Liz Cheney	[Grow + Both +] Republican elected officials are supporting Harris for President — like Wyoming Congresswoman Liz Cheney, Arizona Senator Jeff Flake, and many others.	1.1%	75%
GOP Support + GOP Oppose Trump	[Grow + Both +] Republican elected officials are supporting Harris for President—like former Vice President Dick Cheney, Arizona Senator Jeff Flake, and many others. Some other Republicans are refusing to support Trump, like Alaska Senator Lisa Murkowski and Utah Senator Mitt Romney.	1.0%	65%
GOP Support w/Dick Cheney	[Grow + Both +] Republican elected officials are supporting Harris for President—like former Vice President Dick Cheney, Arizona Senator Jeff Flake, and many others.	0.9%	51-59%[2]
GOP Support + Harris Republican Cabinet Appointment	[Grow + Both +] Republican elected officials are supporting Harris for President—like former Vice President Dick Cheney, Arizona Senator Jeff Flake, and many others. Harris has promised to appoint a Republican to serve at a senior level in her Cabinet.	0.9%	51%

---

[2] Implied percentile range for this message from test #1 based on vote choice movement compared to more recent percentile rankings in test #2.

Appendix: Methodology & Full Message Text

Methodology. *Two in-survey randomized control trial experiments were designed by CFFE PAC and conducted by Blue Rose Research between Oct. 22-23 and 24-25, 2024, interviewing a total of 9,262 likely voters nationwide. Each respondent was shown one message, except for a control treatment group that was not shown any message. All respondents were then asked whether they would choose Donald Trump or Kamala Harris in the 2024 US Presidential election. The "Movement" column indicates a message's average treatment effect (ATE) at moving Democratic vote choice above or below the control group. The "Percentile" column indicates the message's performance relative to the other messages Blue Rose Research has tested on this metric during the 2024 cycle. Percentile variations across messages with similar ATEs are due to updated assumptions by Blue Rose Research about the likely electorate over the 4-day period when the surveys were conducted—assumptions that will continue shifting due to likely electorate changes as voters cast their ballots and states update their voter rolls. Blue Rose Research's models and electorate assumptions will continue to be refreshed between now and Election Day, and we would expect to see further shifts in the relationship between a message's ATE and its percentile ranking. The reported percentile reflects Blue Rose Research's best understanding of how each message performs relative to other messages at the time it was tested.*

Treatment	Content	Harris Trump Vote Choice	Percentile
"You may not always agree with me" [Your Family](#) **Video**	This election is a choice between two different visions for America. Harris will take on price gouging to bring down grocery prices and lower the cost of health insurance. Trump wants to cut taxes for the wealthy. Harris wants to cut taxes for the middle class. You may not always agree with her but she will lift up the middle class and be a President for all Americans.	1.2%	86%
Grow + Both + Economists + GOP & Military w/Disagree	She is working to grow our economy by raising Americans' incomes and lowering costs. She will work with leaders in both parties to solve problems for the American people. Economists say that Trump's proposed policies will result in higher prices, higher deficits, and higher interest rates. Many Republican elected officials and former military officers are supporting Harris, even though they disagree with some of her policies.	1.2%	85%
Freedom & Opportunity + Across Party Lines	She's fighting for an America that puts our freedoms and opportunities first. Hardworking people, small business owners, and family farmers built America into the greatest country in the world. America is stronger when we work together to overcome division and distrust. Kamala Harris will work across party lines to lower costs, raise incomes, and protect our freedoms.	1.2%	82%
Grow + Both + Military	She is working to grow our economy by raising Americans' incomes and lowering costs. She will work with leaders in both parties to solve problems for the American people. Many former national security officials and military leaders are supporting Harris for President.	1.1%	80%
Grow + Both + GOP Support Liz Cheney	She is working to grow our economy by raising Americans' incomes and lowering costs. She will work with leaders in both parties to solve problems for the American people. Republican elected officials are supporting Harris for President — like Wyoming Congresswoman Liz Cheney, Arizona Senator Jeff Flake, and many others.	1.1%	75%
[MVP in Philly 1:](#) **Across + Enemies List**	She will work across party lines to lower costs, raise incomes, and protect our freedoms. The decision for the American people in this election is very serious. Either Trump will sit in the Oval Office plotting revenge and retribution against his enemies. Or Harris will work to lift up the American people by bringing down grocery prices or investing in our economy, our small businesses, and our families.	1.1%	75%
[MVP in Philly 2:](#) **Across + More Republicans Everyday**	She will work across party lines to lower costs, raise incomes, and protect our freedoms. Every day, more Republican elected officials are courageously supporting Harris for President. Leaders in our country understand what is at stake, regardless of their political party.	1.1%	73%
Grow + Both + Economists + GOP w/out Disagree	She is working to grow our economy by raising Americans' incomes and lowering costs. She will work with leaders in both parties to solve problems for the American people. Economists say that Trump's proposed policies will result in higher prices, higher deficits, and higher interest rates. Many Republican elected officials and former military officers are supporting Harris.	1.1%	71%

Across + Both + Plouffe Tweet	She will work across party lines to lower costs, raise incomes, and protect our freedoms. She will work with leaders in both parties to solve problems for the American people. Trump is increasingly unstable and unhinged. He wants unchecked power. He wants the military to go after any American who disagrees with him.	1.1%	70%
Grow + Both + GOP Support + Oppose Trump	She is working to grow our economy by raising Americans' incomes and lowering costs. She will work with leaders in both parties to solve problems for the American people. Republican elected officials are supporting Harris for President—like former Vice President Dick Cheney, Arizona Senator Jeff Flake, and many others. Some other Republicans are refusing to support Trump, like Alaska Senator Lisa Murkowski and Utah Senator Mitt Romney.	1.0%	65%
Across + Protesters & Generals	She will work across party lines to lower costs, raise incomes, and protect our freedoms. When Trump was President, he wanted to shoot Americans who were peacefully protesting against violence. But the American Generals and senior White House staff stopped him. Now, many people who know Trump best because they served in his White House, don't want him to be President again.	0.9%	59%
Grow + Both + GOP Support Dick Cheney	She is working to grow our economy by raising Americans' incomes and lowering costs. She will work with leaders in both parties to solve problems for the American people. Republican elected officials are supporting Harris for President—like former Vice President Dick Cheney, Arizona Senator Jeff Flake, and many others.	0.9%	51-59[3]
Grow + Both + GOP Support + Republican Cabinet	She is working to grow our economy by raising Americans' incomes and lowering costs. She will work with leaders in both parties to solve problems for the American people. Republican elected officials are supporting Harris for President—like former Vice President Dick Cheney, Arizona Senator Jeff Flake, and many others. Harris has promised to appoint a Republican to serve at a senior level in her Cabinet.	0.9%	51%
Across + North Korea & Generals	She will work across party lines to lower costs, raise incomes, and protect our freedoms. When Trump was President, he wanted to attack North Korea even though they have nuclear weapons. But the American Generals and senior White House staff stopped him. Now, many people who know Trump best because they served in his White House, don't want him to be President again.	0.8%	38%
Solve Problems + Blueprint Closing without Capitol Riot	She will work with leaders in both parties to solve problems for the American people. Nearly half of Donald Trump's cabinet have refused to endorse him. Republican Governors, Senators, and House members have all said the same thing: we can't give Trump another four years as president.	0.7%	36%
MVP Oct 23 Remarks: Hitler	She will work across party lines to lower costs, raise incomes, and protect our freedoms. This week, Donald Trump's former chief of staff, John Kelly, a retired four-star general, confirmed that while Trump was president he said he wanted generals like Adolf Hitler had. Trump does not want a military that is loyal to the United States Constitution. He wants a military that is only loyal to him.	0.7%	35%
Solve Problems + Policy but Not Risk	She will work with leaders in both parties to solve problems for the American people. Many Republican elected leaders and senior military officials are opposing Trump. Even though they agree with many of his policies, they don't think we can take the risk of him becoming President again.	0.7%	32-35%[4]
Solve Problems + GOP Support + Military Oppose + Generals	She will work with leaders in both parties to solve problems for the American people. Republican elected officials are supporting Harris for President—like former Vice President Dick Cheney, Arizona Senator Jeff Flake, and many others. Many veterans and former military officers are opposing Trump, including the Generals who served as his Defense Secretary, his WH chief of staff, and Joint Chiefs Chairman.	0.6%	32%

---

[3] Implied percentile range for this message from test #1 based on vote choice movement compared to more recent percentile rankings in test #2.
[4] Implied percentile range for this message from test #1 based on vote choice movement compared to more recent percentile rankings in test #2.

Solve Problems + GOP Support + Military Oppose	She will work with leaders in both parties to solve problems for the American people. Republican elected officials are supporting Harris for President—like former Vice President Dick Cheney, Arizona Senator Jeff Flake, and many others. Many veterans and former military officers are opposing Trump.	0.6%	30%
Solve Problems + Kelly: w/out Son + Policies + "Dangerous"	She will work with leaders in both parties to solve problems for the American people. Trump's own White House Chief of Staff, a former 4-star General, said in an interview on October 22nd that he agreed with many of Trump's policies but, quote "it's a very dangerous thing to have the wrong person elected to high office."	0.5%	23%
Kelly: w/out Son + Policies + Danger	Trump's own White House Chief of Staff, a former 4-star General, said in an interview on October 22nd that he agreed with many of Trump's policies but still does not want him to become President again. The General believes Trump is far too dangerous to make president again.	0.5%	20%
Solve Problems + Kelly: w/out Son + Policies + w/out Danger	She will work with leaders in both parties to solve problems for the American people. Trump's own White House Chief of Staff, a former 4-star General, said in an interview on October 22nd that he agreed with many of Trump's policies but still does not want him to become President again.	0.4%	19%
[**Blueprint Closing Argument**](#) **(Verbatim)**	Nearly half of Donald Trump's cabinet have refused to endorse him. When Trump learned during the Capitol riot that his supporters were threatening to kill his own vice president, he said "so what?" and refused to do anything to ensure the vice president was safe. Republican governors, senators, and House members have all said the same thing: we can't give Trump another four years as president.	0.4%	16%
Kelly: H4P Spox:	Trump's own White House Chief of Staff, a former 4-star General, said in an interview on October 22nd that he agreed with many of Trump's policies but still does not want him to become President again. The people who know Trump best are ringing alarm bells about a second Trump term, where an unhinged and unrestrained Trump surrounded by loyalists and yes-men is a risk America cannot afford.	0.3%	14%
Kelly: w/Son + Policies + Danger	Trump's own White House Chief of Staff, a former 4-star General whose son died in combat in Afghanistan, said in an interview on October 22nd that he agreed with many of Trump's policies but still does not want him to become President again. The General believes Trump is far too dangerous to make president again.	0.3%	13%
Kelly: w/out Son + Policies + Definition of Fascist	Trump's own White House Chief of Staff, a former 4-star General, said in an interview on October 22nd that he agreed with many of Trump's policies but still does not want him to become President again. The General said quote "he's certainly an authoritarian, admires people who are dictators. So he certainly falls into the general definition of fascist, for sure."	0.3%	13%
Kelly: America and Constitution	Trump's own White House Chief of Staff, a former 4-star General, said in an interview on October 22nd that he agreed with many of Trump's policies but still does not want him to become President again. He said quote "He's certainly the only president that has all but rejected what America is all about, and what makes America America, in terms of our Constitution and our values."	0.3%	12%
Kelly: Military attack the Enemy Within	Trump's own White House Chief of Staff, a former 4-star General, said in an interview on October 22nd that he agreed with many of Trump's policies but still does not want him to become President again. He said quote "using the military to go after American citizens is a very bad thing, even to say it for political purposes to get elected. Let alone actually doing it."	0.2%	11%
Kelly: w/out Son + Policies + Dictator Approach	Trump's own White House Chief of Staff, a former 4-star General, said in an interview on October 22nd that he agreed with many of Trump's policies but still does not want him to become President again. The General said quote "He certainly prefers the dictator approach to government."	0.1%	8%
GOP - Inflation (Standard)	Because the worst inflation in 40 years is fleecing American consumers from the gas pump to the grocery store. Democrats' policies have prices rising faster than wages, with years of rising costs on Democrats' watch. Imagine what several more years of these failed Democrat policies would feel like.	-0.8%	64%

(This page was intentionally left blank.)